



July 10, 2013

Lisa Nichols
Senior Planner
City of Ithaca Planning Department
108 E. Green Street
Ithaca, NY 14850

RE: 130 East Clinton Street, Ithaca, NY

Dear Lisa:

Attached please find additional information with regards to outstanding issues as noted on FEAF Part III dated 6/25/13.

1. Dwg. C100 updated Existing Conditions Plan to clearly illustrate delineation of area of portion of Parcel A marked as "Not To Be Developed".
2. Dwg. C101 updated Dimension Plan illustrating distances from the center line of the Six Mile Creek to the edge of the creek and then to the proposed sheet piling and to the proposed building.
3. Dwg. C102 updated Demolition Plan clearly illustrating Extent of Disturbances, and a schedule of trees to be removed.
4. Dwg. L101 updated illustrating planting design and schedule for the proposed project.
5. Dwg. L102 (new drawing) illustrating planting schedule and notes documenting the proposed mitigation for the loss of tree canopy. Also included is an updated memo from Robert Wesley further articulating the ecological character of the project site.
6. Impact on Transportation: Construction vehicle ingress and egress will use existing curb cut on Prospect Street to the existing upper parking area in front of Limestone Tower.
7. Impact on Growth & Character of Community or neighborhood. In response to comments on page 11 of FEAF we have attached an email memo dated July 7, 2013 from David Herrick of T.G. Miller to Tim Logue outlining answers to the issues raised.

Thank you for your time and help in this matter.

Sincerely,

Jagat Sharma

Cc: Scott Whitham
David Herrick

Attachments: 25 (11" x 17") copies of drawings dated July 5, 2013:

- C100
- C101
- C102
- L101
- L102
- Memo from Robert Wesley
- Memo from David Herrick to Tim Logue.

ARCHITECTURE

SPACE PLANNING

INTERIOR DESIGN

URBAN DESIGN

312 East Seneca Street

Ithaca, New York 14850

Phone (607) 272-9361

Fax (607) 272-0505

Web www.sharma-arch.com

Email info@sharma-arch.com

Plants of 130 East Clinton Street, Ithaca

The following vascular plant species were found here in April of 2013 during the flora and fauna survey of this 1.75-acre parcel in the City of Ithaca located at 130 East Clinton Street, that constitutes tax parcel number 81.-3-2.1, and are listed below. The first list is comprised of those species, native and otherwise, growing wild, without cultivation. If a species has seeded into the wild or spread vegetatively, even though it is a non-native, cultivated plant, it is in the first list. The second list is overgrown or abandoned plantings, where the species planted has survived and persisted, but not spread. Non-native species are indicated by an asterisk (*).

Ecologically, the forests and other areas of this parcel that are not mown or gardened, are a mix of Maple-basswood rich mesic forest and Successional northern hardwoods forest, as defined in the following publication: Edinger, G.J., D.J. Evans, S. Gebauer, T.G. Howard, D.M. Hunt, and A.M. Olivero. 2002. Ecological Communities of New York State. Second Edition. A revised and expanded edition of Carol Reschke's Ecological Communities of New York State. New York Natural Heritage Program, New York State Department of Environmental Conservation. See: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/animals/29392.html> to view the entire publication. While the forests do contain many native species, nothing here approaches undisturbed natural vegetation. There is abundant evidence of history of disturbance: old walls, abandoned walks and stairs, earthworks (filling and grading), abandoned plantings, refuse dumping and formerly cultivated species that have spread. I am fairly certain that the entire site has been de-forested multiple times. The largest areas of continuous forest are on the steep slopes of almost bare shale bedrock bordering Sixmile Creek, and these are almost pure Norway maple (*Acer platanoides*) stands.

Vascular plant species growing without cultivation

<i>Acer negundo</i>	box elder
<i>Acer platanoides</i> *	Norway maple
<i>Acer saccharum</i>	sugar maple
<i>Aegopodium podagraria</i> *	goutweed
<i>Aesculus hippocastanum</i> *	horse chestnut
<i>Ageratina altissima</i> (<i>Eupatorium rugosum</i>)	white snakeroot
<i>Ailanthus altissima</i> *	tree-of-heaven
<i>Alliaria petiolata</i> *	garlic mustard
<i>Arctium minus</i> *	burdock
<i>Aster lateriflorus</i> (<i>Symphotrichum lateriflorum</i>)	calico aster
<i>Barbarea vulgaris</i> *	yellow rocket
<i>Bromus inermis</i> *	smooth brome grass
<i>Campanula rapunculoides</i> *	creeping bellflower
<i>Campanula trachelium</i> *	nettle-leaved bellflower
<i>Cardamine hirsuta</i> *	hairy cress
<i>Celtis occidentalis</i>	hackberry
<i>Chelidonium majus</i> *	celandine
<i>Cichorium intybus</i> *	chicory

<i>Cirsium vulgare</i> *	bull thistle
<i>Cornus racemosa</i>	gray dogwood
<i>Coronilla varia</i> *	crown vetch
<i>Dactylis glomerata</i> *	orchard grass
<i>Erigeron strigosus</i>	daisy fleabane
<i>Euonymus fortunei</i> *	evergreen bittersweet
<i>Fagus sylvatica</i> *	European beech
<i>Festuca pratensis (Schedonorus pratensis)*</i>	meadow fescue grass
<i>Forsythia viridissima</i> *	forsythia
<i>Fraxinus americana</i>	white ash
<i>Galium aparine</i>	annual bedstraws
<i>Galium mollugo</i> *	white bedstraws
<i>Geum canadense</i>	white avens
<i>Glechoma hederacea</i> *	ground ivy, creeping charlie
<i>Hedera helix</i> *	English ivy
<i>Hesperis matronalis</i> *	rocket
<i>Juglans nigra</i>	black walnut
<i>Juniperus virginiana</i>	red cedar
<i>Lamium purpureum</i> *	dead-nettle
<i>Lapsana communis</i> *	nipplewort
<i>Leonurus cardiaca</i> *	motherwort
<i>Ligustrum obtusifolium</i> *	Asian privet
<i>Linaria vulgaris</i> *	butter-and-eggs, toadflax
<i>Lonicera morrowii</i> *	Asian honeysuckle
<i>Lonicera tatarica</i> *	Tartarian honeysuckle
<i>Melissa officinalis</i> *	lemon balm
<i>Muhlenbergia mexicana</i>	Mexican dropseed
<i>Nepeta cataria</i> *	catnip
<i>Phytolacca americana</i>	pokeweed
<i>Picea abies</i> *	Norway spruce
<i>Plantago lanceolata</i> *	narrow-leaved plantain
<i>Plantago major</i> *	broad-leaved plantain
<i>Poa alsodes</i>	woodland bluegrass
<i>Poa annua</i> *	annual bluegrass
<i>Poa nemoralis</i>	grove bluegrass
<i>Poa pratensis</i> *	Kentucky bluegrass
<i>Prunus serotina</i>	black cherry
<i>Prunus virginiana</i>	choke cherry
<i>Quercus rubra</i>	red oak
<i>Ranunculus abortivus</i>	kidney-leaved buttercup
<i>Ranunculus acris</i> *	tall meadow buttercup
<i>Rhamnus cathartica</i> *	buckthorn
<i>Rhamnus frangula (Frangula alnus)*</i>	alder-leaved buckthorn
<i>Rhus typhina</i>	staghorn sumac

<i>Robinia pseudoacacia</i> *	black locust
<i>Rumex obtusifolius</i> *	broad-leaved dock
<i>Solidago caesia</i>	wreath goldenrod
<i>Solidago rugosa</i>	hairy or rough goldenrod
<i>Stellaria holostea</i> *	Easter bells, stitchwort
<i>Syringa vulgaris</i> *	lilac
<i>Taraxacum officinale</i> *	dandelion
<i>Taxus cuspidata</i> *	Japanese yew
<i>Tilia americana</i>	basswood
<i>Trifolium repens</i> *	white clover
<i>Ulmus americana</i>	American elm
<i>Vinca minor</i> *	periwinkle, myrtle
<i>Vitis riparia</i>	riverbank grape

Abandoned plantings; cultivated, nursery-source species

<i>Acer negundo</i>	box elder
<i>Acer platanoides</i> *	Norway maple
<i>Aesculus hippocastanum</i> *	horse chestnut
<i>Deutzia gracilis</i> *	slender deutzia
<i>Euonymus fortunei</i> *	evergreen bittersweet
<i>Fagus sylvatica</i> *	European beech
<i>Forsythia viridissima</i> *	forsythia
<i>Hedera helix</i> *	English ivy
<i>Ligustrum amurense</i> *	Amur privet
<i>Ligustrum obtusifolium</i> *	Asian privet
<i>Malus sp.</i> *	crabapple
<i>Parthenocissus tricuspidata</i> *	Boston ivy
<i>Picea abies</i> *	Norway spruce
<i>Picea pungens</i> *	Colorado blue spruce
<i>Pseudotsuga menziesii</i> *	Douglas-fir
<i>Spiraea japonica</i> hybrid*	spiraea
<i>Syringa vulgaris</i> *	lilac
<i>Taxus cuspidata</i> *	Japanese yew
<i>Tilia cordata</i> *	linden

Jagat P. Sharma

From: David Herrick [dah@tgmillerpc.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 09, 2013 9:37 AM
To: timlo@cityofithaca.org
Cc: Jagat P. Sharma; scott whitham; Gary Wood
Subject: 130 Clinton Street

Hi Tim,

On pages 10 and 11 of the 6/25 working copy of the FEAF Part 3 (attached) I had inserted responses based on our phone conversation of 6/13. Specifically, I addressed the comments related to the City's street improvement project overlay, utility trench repairs in the new Clinton Street pavement, connection of the private stair/sidewalk to the City walk, and access driveways behind the City's retaining walls. My responses are based on the proposed conditions illustrated in our 5/24/13 drawing submission. Please let me know if you have any further concern on these topics.

In addition to my 6/25 responses, I can report that our surveyors are doing what they can to find documentation on any other permanent easements for the retaining wall tiebacks. In the 5/24 submission, Gary Wood included in his Feasibility Analysis copies of details from the original design and what appear to be submittals from Bermingham Construction. If the submittal is representative of the actual construction, it appears the tie backs extend as much as 70 feet into the adjacent slope from the face of wall. Is there any way to confirm this dimension from your City records? I have to believe there is an easement agreement somewhere for such a taking. Might the City Attorney help in the search?

Also, with respect to the location of bicycle racks you'll note the new layout of 3 stanchions has improved space for access. Please call me if a quick meeting to review our latest set of plans is appropriate, or helpful. Thanks again.

David A. Herrick, P.E.
T.G. Miller, P.C.
Engineers and Surveyors
203 N. Aurora Street
Ithaca, New York 14850
607-272-6477

7/10/2013

IMPACT ON ENERGY

No impact anticipated.

IMPACT ON NOISE & ODORS

Construction impacts only.

IMPACT ON PUBLIC HEALTH

No impact anticipated.

IMPACT ON GROWTH & CHARACTER OF COMMUNITY OR NEIGHBORHOOD

The project has the potential to impact the City Police Department and City improvements to Clinton Street currently in process. In a memo to the Planning Board from Tim Logue, City Transportation Engineer, dated March 15, 2013, he states the following:

"On the drawings, the applicant should provide a site plan overlaying the proposed building and site ~~work, work~~, including stairs, walkway, and any proposed parking lot work with the Prospect Street construction plans, which we sent to the applicant. It is difficult to see if or how this project will work with the street work that is scheduled to start up in May and be finished by August. In regard to the schedule, we will not be interested in utility cuts soon after the street project is completed. It would be in the owner's interest to coordinate utility needs with the City's project manager, Addisu Gebre, and with Fahs Construction, the City's contractor.

Formatted: Highlight

The alignment and extents of the new City construction on Clinton Street have been applied to Drawings C101 through C104 together with notes "Existing Street, Curb and Walk Under Construction". The only impact to the City's new work is the removal of the westerly curb cut currently serving the parking lot at #114 Prospect Street. This modification was reviewed with Tim Logue. With respect to potential utility cuts in the completed street, Tim Logue expected that mitigation would require that all backfill materials, compaction and pavement restoration be equal to the standards required of the City's project.

Formatted: Not Highlight

Lastly, there is not information on the drawings for the tie-backs and the City's easement for the steel retaining wall for the Police Department. The only note I see is for a five foot utility easement. The drawings are showing hemlocks planted on top of the tie-backs, but we will probably not want anything that substantial there.

Formatted: Highlight

A few new comments:

Based on feedback from the City's consulting engineer for the Clinton/Prospect Street project, it still looks like they will be building on the City's right-of-way at the east end of the new retaining wall. The City owns approximately 7 ft (minimum) behind the rear face of the new wall. The use of City property is subject to Chapter 170 of the City Code.

Formatted: Highlight

Only a short length of sidewalk and stairway will cross over the City highway line. This is not uncommon to nearly every site development project that links public sidewalks with private access. Tim Logue did not expect this condition to be significant but may require a renewable lease agreement to be executed with the City.

The concern about surcharging the existing wall with a vehicle loading should not be a concern since it appears they are only proposing a pedestrian path; however, during construction, as shown on drawing C102 a vehicle driveway is proposed. We will need a full structural evaluation of this proposal by a licensed engineer. Similar to comment on previous plans: several utilities have been relocated as part of the City project in the area of the wall. The feasibility of relocating utilities as part of the apartment project will need to be thoroughly investigated based on their final location at the completion of the City project.

Formatted: Highlight

The latest drawing submission no longer includes any temporary or permanent vehicle driveway behind the City's new retaining walls. Only a 5' wide pedestrian sidewalk will be located behind the City wall.

The location chosen for the five bike racks will not provide enough space around the racks for bicycles. We can provide design guidelines upon request."